

The Process of Human Enlightening: Reflections from the History of Philosophy

Naveda Kitchlew, Sami Ullah Bajwa, and Qamar Ali

Author(s) Biography

Naveda Kitchlew is Assistant Professor at Department of Management, School of Business and Economics, University of Management and Technology, C-2, Johar Town, Lahore-54770, Pakistan
Email: naveda.kitchlew@umt.edu.pk

Sami Ullah Bajwa is working with Small and Medium Enterprises Development Authority, Government of Pakistan.
Email: samibajwa@hotmail.com

Qamar Ali is working in Department of Business Administration, Government College University Faisalabad, Pakistan.
Email: qamarwaince@gmail.com

ABSTRACT: *The purpose of this paper is to highlight major contributions in the process of human enlightening, by looking into the roots of philosophy from Greeks through the modern Western philosophers. From the outset this paper becomes a brief note on human efforts of broadening and strengthening their understandings about physical and metaphysical aspects of life. Starting from 'Greeks awakening' and going through different religious and philosophical contributions, this paper focuses on the enlightenment movement of the West. Moreover, in the end, it gives a glimpse of counter enlightenment— a movement against the essence of enlightenment.*

Keywords: *Enlightenment, Greeks Awakening, Metaphysics, Renaissance, Reformation*

This paper highlights major contributions in the process of human enlightening by looking into the roots of philosophy from Greeks through the modern western philosophers. The word enlightenment, in this paper, is not meant, merely, the western movement of enlightenment in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries rather, it is taken as ‘education that results in understanding and the spread of knowledge’ (Princeton Education). This paper thus comprises a brief note on human efforts of broadening and strengthening their understandings about themselves and the universe.

Enlightenment, according to Kant, is man’s emergence from his self-imposed immaturity (Foucault, 1986). Immaturity is the inability to use one’s understanding without guidance from another. This immaturity is self-imposed when its cause lies not in lack of understanding, but in lack of resolve and courage to use it without guidance from another. Sapere Aude! [Dare to know] “Have courage to use your own understanding!”—that is the motto of enlightenment.

With this definition of enlightenment one can travel through the course of history and find out philosophers who tried to implement their understanding rather than taking the established truths for granted. This is how a passage of human enlightening can be traced through the history.

The evolution of human knowledge is long and scattered across the globe. The term, philosophy, akin to many other basic concepts like arts, truth and normalcy etc, does not contain a single unified definition. Until recently, theology and philosophy were not considered two different disciplines of studies. Even when we include the names like Aristotle, Newton, and Michelangelo etc, in the history of philosophy, we pretend to mean that philosophy is not a (Martin, 1957). The concept, though seems vague, is not far away from reality. History of philosophy at its core is history of ideas. Human inspiration towards exploring the very nature of physical and metaphysical objects is thus philosophy and for that reason not a single branch of knowledge is beyond the scope of it.

This paper underlines the course of western philosophy. Starting from the Greeks, it covers the remarkable work of western philosophers. Besides providing an overview of major philosophical moments like Renaissance, Reformation, Enlightenment, Counter enlightenment, Romanticism etc, it underlines the impact of philosophical understanding in different religious and societal moments of the west. Further, it gives a glimpse of notable contributions of philosophers in each movement and era.

The Greek Period – Dawn of Philosophical Era

Myths and Mysticism has been essential, if not central, part of philosophy right from the golden age it experienced during emergence of Greek civilization. Interestingly, besides helping Plato to explain his philosophies, Greek Mythology has influenced European philosophers to a great extent. Freud’s attempt to explain complex sexual relations (Freud, 1924) between children and their parents through Hellenic myth of ‘Oedipus (Story of a young man who fell in love with her mother)’ is one among many of such examples.

Greek philosophy is classified into two periods – Pre & after Socrates. The pre-Socratic period, predominantly focused on physical objects of the world, is characterized by Thales - who categorized Water as foundation element of the world and by Pythagoras - founder of Pythagoras brotherhood & mathematics – who’s love of numbers led to the development of numerous mathematical equations and hypothesis (Urban & Rhoads, 2003).

Socrates (469-399 B.C) was the first to give metaphysical direction to philosophy. Apart from his conscious acceptance of knowing nothing and hence being wiser among others, Socrates reasoned the substance for learning, teaching and practicing Virtues – the basic ingredient for him to run state affairs (Lane, 2002). Although sentenced death for his fierce criticism of contemporary establishment, Socrates left deep influence on all echelons of Greek society. Socrates never wrote something by his own. Everything we know about is sourced from writings of his disciple, Plato (427-347 B.C). While he himself belonged to an influential political family, Plato followed the Socratic doctrine of enlightening politician with philosophies of Virtues. Consequently, he set up first ever institute of Philosophy, named as Academy. In his famous writing, *The Republic*, Plato transpired ideas for making an ideal community. Whilst acknowledging the significance of physical attraction, Plato insisted that sexual desires be controlled for greater interest of society (Mukherjee, Mukherjee, & Ramaswamy, 2002).

Philosophy has never been as systematic and logical as in the work of Aristotle (384-322 B.C) a student of Plato. His theory of metaphysics (i.e. Philosophical understanding of reality) was merely an interpretation of Platonic theory of Ideas (Robinson, 1990). Aristotle believed man a political animal by nature and highlighted our core need of seeking self-preservation through social networking.

The contribution of Socrates, Plato, and Aristotle towards philosophy is immeasurable. However, one cannot overrule the significance of two schools of philosophical

pessimism – Cynicism and Skepticism – emerged in this period. The most famous among cynics, Diogenes, rejected all conventions of social needs and argued that we spend our lives for chasing objects which either are already ours or are of no use to us (Shea, 2010). On the other hand, Pyrrho – the father of Greek scepticism, proclaimed the poverty of all knowledge produced by Socrates, Plato, and Aristotle because of its basis on statements, which according to skeptic thoughts are nothing more than assumptions. Skeptic idea of inexistence of ultimate truth has always been a great interest of philosophers (Kennedy, 1999).

Philosophy and Religion – The Rise of Catholic Church From Greeks to modern era, religion has deeply influenced contemporary philosophers in one way or the other. Nirvana & 8 Fold Path of Buddhism, Cast System and Reincarnation of Hindus, Kami and Human Purity of Shinto's, most explicit among religions – the Moral Conduct of Islam and Taoist Way of Lao Tzu (China) are some of the supporting illustrations. Philosophical attempt to prove existence of God, however, have earned very little credibility (Neuberger, 2004).

Instead of wrongly conceived myth which held assumed Eastern barbarianism an oppressive reason, it was Christianity which escorted the emergence of western philosophy. The dark and middle ages in Europe embarked on Catholic Church's control on education, theology, religion, and cultural events. Furthermore, supremacy of Papacy of Pope Gregory IV in 11th century and imposition of Inquisition by Pope Gregory IX (1233) led dominance of doctrinaires of Saint Augustine (354-430).

Augustine gave philosophical justifications and coherent believe system to Catholic Christianity. Adding to Plato's assertion of human existence through God's eternal substances, he affirmed God as absolute foundation. Augustine's argument that body's will be controlled so as to be victorious and avoid Original Sin was first challenged by John Du Scot (An Irish Philosopher – 800-877), who claimed that real God's will is to encourage reasoning of man (Catto, 1976).

Dominicans along with Franciscans were at centre of religious and scholarly enlightenment of Europe during 13th and 14th century. Most promising work of the 13th century was of Thomas Aquinas (1225-74), a Dominican, who helped Catholic Christianity to bring out of the impasses of considering knowledge of natural laws threatening. His writings were part of Cultural Revolution of 13th century, which witnessed setting up of universities all across the Europe and popularity of several liberal arts including Music, Astronomy, Grammar, Logic, Arithmetic, and Geometry etc.

Aquinas's chief philosophical contribution, however, was to help loosening the grip of Plato on scholastic thinking by claiming that in reverse to the Plato's description, source of all knowledge is Particulars which can be abstracted into Universally (Schönberger, 2001). Among Franciscans, Roger Bacon is famous for practicing Experimental Research, which at that time was considered heretical whereas William of Occam (1285) insisted that words and concepts are not real, only particular things – in themselves are real. His famous maxims, popularly known as Occam's razor, states that it is vain to do with more which can be done with fewer. Another important name of Franciscans is Dunus Scouts who contributed in famous theological debate between Dominicans and Franciscans. The key issue in debate was Ancient Greek question of essence i.e.; does each things contain an individual essence or all things within a particular frame are made of the same essence (O'Donnell, 1959).

Renaissance to Reformation

The spirit of renaissance super headed the cultural revolution of 14th and 15th century in Europe (Ben-Yehuda, 1980). With the demise of Constantinople, the eternal city, West needed a cultural hub and cities of Italy took up the mental. Petrarch, the poetic father of Italy, is said to mark the beginning of Renaissance. Education and learning became so fashionable in this period that scholars and philosophers became public figures (Piccone, 1968). The scientific discoveries, most notably the astrological one, of Renaissance were combined with exploration of world. Columbus discovered America in 1442 whereas Portuguese rounded the cape for the 1st time in 1447. It was followed by Copernicus's great scientific discovery i.e. a revolutionary view of solar system. He is claimed to be first to discover that sun rather than earth is centre of universe. Renaissance enlarged the decorative splendour of arts by using paintings and sculptures to reflect deepening knowledge of man. Michelangelo is most well-known name of this era. The moment which is associated with Renaissance is Humanism – which strained to study cultural artefacts of human rather than considering him divine creature of God (Braudel, 1982).

In late 15th century a resentment of corruption, indulgences, and moral political power of church has been developed. Martin Luther (1483 – Germany), a professor of biblical theology argued that there is a gulf between words of God represented in sculpture and church as institution (Pattberg, 2007). For Luther, activities of daily life were of more concern to God than pilgrimages and rituals of church. This was beginning of Protestantism as an intellectual moment. Germany is

regarded spiritual home of this philosophical moment – known as Reformation (Stayer, 2000).

European states thus had to cope with religious diversity within its boundaries. The Reformation was given hype by John Calvin (1509-64; head of church in Geneva 1541) who encouraged states to reject Catholic Church. Alike Luther he preached strict obedience to moral conduct rather than religious obedience – as emphasized by Catholics (Bigler, 1965).

Political philosophy started with legendary work of Niccolo Machiavelli (1469-1527, Italy, 2nd Chancellor – Florence Government). In his famous book, *The Prince*, Machiavelli persuaded that 1st principle of governing is consolidation of political power and success of ruler can only be assessed with his political strength (Ribner, 1954). For Machiavelli a virtuous prince is not who rules by the laws of evil and good but one who is willing to do whatever may be necessary for civic glory (Machiavelli, Bondanella, & Viroli, 2008). The work of Machiavelli, considered devilish at that time, is sounded by myths and infamy, and is widely misunderstood. Ever since 17th century, another political theory which has a profound impact on today's politics is of a dissident professor, namely Thomas Hobbes (1588-1679). At the outset, Hobbes defined human nature and argued that there is no truth, justice, and reason in reality rather all these are artificial attributes of civilizations (Bejan, 2010). He advocated the absolute power of state. For Hobbes one can only live under violent and selfish shadow of human nature, as it is witnessed among children before the get tamed by civilization, or to empower few people to run the state and bring relative harmony and comfort (Hobbes & Molesworth, 1844).

Erasmus (1466-1536, Rotterdam Holland) was key figure of northern Renaissance. In his famous book, Erasmus squabbled that pursuit of happiness as object of life was folly and that elegance and simplicity of philosophy is more worthy than complexity which most philosopher experience (Creighton, 1911). Although Erasmus's anti-intelligence views were not an important contribution to philosophy, yet his legacy was to promote rhetorical elegance, grammatical correctness, and writing style among most of public schools in Europe. One can see the skeptic inclination of Erasmus's work towards complex philosophical deliberations (Schoeck, 1991). The feel of contemporary cultural plurality and religious difference led Montaigne (1533-92), a famous skeptic, to take inspiration from ancient Greek skepticism and ascertain that all that is certain is that nothing is certain (Locher, 1976). While he himself promoted conformity to dominant traditions, Montaigne supported his believe of unreliability of human knowledge with illustration of moral and cultural difference among Africa and Europe and within Europe itself (Eva, 2009).

The spirit of scientific experiments was endorsed by Francis Bacon (1561-1626) who thus contributed to loosen the grip of Aristotle's logic which held science, philosophy, and theology captive for centuries (Bacon, 2000). He argued that laws of nature can only be understood and controlled through reasoning. [Herein famous maxim originates: Knowledge is Power]. Bacon's legacy was to emphasise the need of diverting philosophical direction from abstract moral speculation to practical affairs. He described 4 learning hindrances and named them as Knowledge Idols (Rössner, 2007).

Enlightenment Movement – The Age of Reason

During 17th century, the augmenting conflict between religion and science endowed philosophy with the mandate to take human destiny away from the hands of religion and put it in free will of man. The important contribution of Galileo (Italy 1564-1642) helped in desertion of the effect of religious believes, logic and Aristotle's physics on scientific teachings. Galileo further developed Copernicus's theory that instead of being static, sun revolves around earth (Blackwell, 1991). The journey of scientific exploration embarked on new dimensions with the work of Newton (1642-1727). His deliberations of physics and mathematics are regarded as sprit of enlightenment (Greenstreet & Newton, 1927).

Writers and artists were alongside philosophers and scientists in spreading the word of enlightenment. The role of French intelligentsia is distinctive in this regard. The tradition of Greek story telling (Homer) returned with the plays of Shakespeare and philosophical tales of Voltaire (Westfall, 1989).

Descartes (1596-1650) is widely considered the father of modern philosophy. He reiterated Plato and Aristotle's distinction between senses and intellect. To Descartes the experience creates doubts (his famous narration is demons of doubts) and therefore innate ideas have to be in mind prior to the experience. The outset of his philosophical work was based on the logical statement to prove certainty "I think therefore I am". The substance theory of Aristotle, Plato and indeed Descartes was questioned by Spinoza (Holland 1632-77) who proposed existence of only one substance in the world – the God. Besides this theological philosophy, Spinoza insisted that self – preservation was key motive behind every action and therefore ethics of a man. Furthermore, self-preservation of human will never depend completely on state and there must be limited control / power of the state.

Enlightenment has been caught in the dilemma of reconciliation of free will and existence of a supreme God. It was G.W Leibniz (1646 – 1716), who while presenting the view that there must be a sufficient reason

for why the world is at it is, attempted to solve this riddle. The foundation of Empiricism, a view that all knowledge is based on Experience, and of modern liberal state was led by John Lock's work. Lock proposed that our knowledge was not developed before our experience. Additionally, he refuted Hobbes's political philosophy of providing justification to Royalists (Locke, 1836). The best form of government for Lock was one with separation of powers between legislators, the execution, and judiciary. Another contribution towards Empiricism was of George Berkley (Ireland 1685- 1753). The great deal of his philosophy is concerned with challenging famous figures of early 18th century including Descartes, Newton, and Lock. The important contribution of Berkley was his philosophical arguments that matter or substance cannot be said to actually exist, independently of mind.

While Empiricists believed experiment as only way of achieve knowledge, Rationalists were claiming the reason as source of all knowledge. It was Immanuel Kant (1724 – 1804) who guided Enlightenment beyond this debate by proposing a synthesis of both paradigms. In concurrence to Rationalists, Kant held pure reason a source of knowing how things appear to us and at the same time, in lined with Empiricists, he put forwarded that all what we know through pure reason can only be applied through experience, an therein we get most of our knowledge (Kant, 1964). In response to the Kant's challenge to the limits of pure reason, Georg Wilhelm Hegel (1770 – 1831) developed a radical new form of logic which he called speculation and now widely known as dialects. Hegel also provided a framework of relation between mind and nature, subject and object of knowledge, state, arts and philosophy etc (Hegel & Wood, 1991).

Another important contribution towards Enlightenment was the philosophical movement, namely Existentialism, which condemned the prevailing understanding of human beings as a creature of deities, God or higher authority and argued that individual create the meaning and essence of their existence. Existentialists proposed that 'existence precedes essence'. Essentially it tend to maintain that there is no predetermined essence of humans and therefore individual define their own essence are responsible for their conducts (Stretch, 1967).

The enlightenment skepticism was stepped up by David Hume (1711-76) (Castiglione, 1998). Though he fully embraced the secular spirit of Enlightenment, Hume was skeptic about vigorous endorsement of human rationality. While stressing the communal disposition of human beings, Hume followed Lock in rejecting Hobbes's claim that humans, at core, are brutal and violent (Hume & Beauchamp, 2000).

18th century witnessed the role of Enlightenment as an important ingredient in revolutions. After-effects of French revolution – the Declaration of Rights of Man and Citizens was a key milestone in history of philosophy. Similarly, idea of United States of America represented the ideals which spearheaded the Enlightenment, in their most acute form. The revolution in America and France led to the modern concepts of nation, human rights, citizenship, and constitutional governments. Chief contribution of philosophy herein was to ensure freedom of peoples without resorting to the creation of an over powerful state to protect it citizens. Thomas Paine's (1737-1809) contributions for liberties of ordinary citizens were significant in both of these revolutions (Robbins, 1983). Paine was champion philosopher against monarchy rule and its hereditary rights of legislation. On the other hand, there were traditionalists of the era who were skeptic about the rise of natural rights and equalities of peoples, as foundation element of governments. Edmund Burke (1729-97) was one such philosopher. His famous writing Reflection on the Revolution of France produced powerful defence of British Government system. Burke's ideas of organic society (i.e. society functions as human body), pragmatism, and belief in traditions became three pillars of modern Conservatism.

Counter Enlightenment

As one can observe, conservation, particularly religious and cultural, was primary source of critique on enlightenment. However, Jean Jacques Rousseau (1712-78) was first to question age of reason without religious doctrines. As his famed quote "Man was borne free and he is everywhere in chains" depicts, Rousseau was originally a critique of civic and scientific advancement. The idea that human salvation lies in State of Nature flourished in contemporary philosophers. William Godwin (1756-1836) went further to argue that state in any case is an evil and that the society should be established on the basis of love and truth, instead of laws and regulations (Green & Shapiro, 1996).

In late 18th and 19th century, unrest embarked upon among philosophers and poets against the celebration of Reasoning as foundation element of human existence. There was a significant diversity among legends of this era except the common point of their questioning of Enlightenment. The moment, in wider term, is known as Romanticism. Romantics found human nature in perfect harmony under natural conditions and it turned their attention to emotions – as potential grounding feature of human existence. While promoting aesthetics, romantics argued that element of existence could not be expressed through rationality and systematic approach (Bonds, 1997; Mcdaniel, 2013). The foundation of Enlightenment

was also challenged by Nietzsche's (1844-90) philosophical skepticism about Truth (Boesche, 2006). He stressed that there is no moral or scientific natural truth exists and therefore Reasoning in itself is unreasoned. He charged Christianity for taming human hearts and denying the value of exuberant sprits, splendid animalism, instincts of war and concurs, passion, revenge etc and made prophesy that this slaved morality would eventually die in western culture (Oliver, 1998).

The journey of human freedom took another turn in early 19th century when philosophers like Karl Marx (1818-1883) and Proudhon (1809-65) expanded the scope of philosophy to economic ties within societies. Marx was assured that all human phenomenon can be understood through economics (Marx, 1976). The Marx ideology was enthusiastically adopted by Lenin (1870-1924). As a leader of Bolsheviks (Russian Revolutionist Party) in 1917 Russian revolution, Lenin developed Marxism in a practical context and changed the course of 20th century. Lenin's contribution to modern philosophy is important because he managed to put his ideas into practice. At death of Lenin in 1922, a struggle for leadership emerged between his successors - Stalin and Trotsky (1879-1940).

Trotsky remained unable to seize the opportunity and thus to promote his orthodox Marxist views and his ambition of spreading socialism worldwide – against Stalin's approach of One Country Socialism Formula (Deutscher, 2003). He was suppressed, exiled and finally murdered by Stalin's supporters in 1940. The spirit of *Das Capital* however did cross the time and geographic boundaries. Antonio Gramsci (1891-1931) brought Marxism in Italy during 20th century. Mussolini saw Gramsci as a threat to his regime and put him in jail in 1926 for rest of his life. The social base for liberal democracy was also endorsed by an English Philosopher namely Bentham (1748-1832) who outlined that nature has placed humankind under the governance of two sovereign masters – the Pain and the Pleasure. Bentham's theory of punishment and philosophy was centred to ensure a government system that makes aggregated level of pleasure outweigh to the pain.

The Concluding Phase

During 19th century, a new age of scientific exploration commenced and spread throughout western regime. Discontented Human curiosity of finding the ultimate truth through philosophy started looking into science as a ray of another hope (Oliver, 1998). The immediate obstacle popped in the course was inability of scientific application upon metaphysical objects, for instance Soul, Truth, Values etc. Inauguration of Vienna Circle (1920s) was a dedicated effort to rupture this syndrome and draw a patent line between philosophy and science. Vienna

Circle was a group of philosophers, scientists, and mathematicians who joined together and discussed the foundations of science and philosophy. Their intention was clear – to rid philosophy from metaphysical speculations. Once the criterion was set, role of philosophy in quest of knowledge got limited to distinguish, what is nonsense and what is not nonsense. Foundations of philosophy shattered with growing acknowledgement of science as more vigorous and credible source of answering the meaning of existence. Karl Popper (1902-95) contribution of providing a theory that explained how science works and how can it be distinguished from nonsense expedited the anti-philosophy concerns. Popper rejected the common understanding of scientific induction and elucidated that at first a theory (idea) emerges and then it is tested through observations and scientific experimentation before it is accepted or rejected (Popper, 1972).

Another group, organized for discussing the undisclosed dimensions of philosophy, is known as Oxbridge circle. These philosophers advocated that philosophical quests can be concluded through analysis. The analytical philosophy emerged from this period is mainly concerned with concepts and prepositions. The distinguished contributions towards analytical philosophy are of Bertrand Russell and Wittgenstein. Russell (1872-1970), a mathematician turned dedicated philosopher and author of 40 books, was concerned to eliminate speculative content of philosophy and purify it with unmediated logical foundations (Russell & Eames, 1984).

The later great philosopher – Wittgenstein was a professor at Cambridge University along with Russell before his joining of Austrian army during World War – I. His robust but logical challenge to the rational of studying philosophy put the future of philosophy in storm (Wittgenstein, 1958). Wittgenstein insisted that all philosophical questions ignite at attempt to push through beyond the limits imposed upon it by language and that structure of language reveals the structure of world. With the assistance of pictorial demonstration, he expounded that human perception is effected by the internal picture we make rather than those created by the object.

Whereas, analytical philosophy cramped the philosophical interventions to less speculative realm and put it into more logical framework, Wittgenstein's brilliantly destructive approach to philosophy brought it closer to the end. Many commentators of the modern age continue to agree that after Wittgenstein all philosophy is futile.

References

- Bacon, F. (2000). The instauratio magna: Last writings.
- Bejan, T. M. (2010). Teaching the Leviathan: Thomas Hobbes on education. *Oxford Review of Education*, 36(5), 607-626.
- Ben-Yehuda, N. (1980). The European witch craze of the 14th to 17th centuries: A sociologist's perspective. *American Journal of Sociology*, 86(1), 1-31.
- Bigler, R. M. (1965). The rise of political Protestantism in Nineteenth Century Germany: The awakening of political consciousness and the beginning of political activity in the Protestant Clergy of pre-March Prussia. *Church History*, 34(4), 423-444.
- Blackwell, R. J. (1991). *Galileo, Bellarmine, and the bible*: University of Notre Dame Press.
- Boesche, R. (2006). *Tocqueville's Road Map: Methodology, Liberalism, Revolution, and Despotism*: Lexington Books.
- Bonds, M. E. (1997). Idealism and the Aesthetics of Instrumental Music at the Turn of the Nineteenth Century. *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, 50(2-3), 387-420.
- Braudel, F. (1982). *Civilization and Capitalism, 15th-18th Century: The perspective of the world* (Vol. 3): Univ of California Press.
- Castiglione, D. (1998). The Practical Value of Hume's Mitigated Skepticism *The Skeptical Tradition Around 1800* (pp. 221-234): Springer.
- Catto, J. (1976). Ideas and Experience in the Political Thought of Aquinas. *Past & Present*(71), 3-21.
- Creighton, M. (1911). *A History of the Papacy from the Great Schism to the Sack of Rome: The German revolt, 1517-1527* (Vol. 6): Longmans, Green and Company.
- Deutscher, I. (2003). *The prophet armed: Trotsky, 1879-1921*: Verso.
- Eva, L. (2009). Montaigne's radical skepticism *Skepticism in the Modern Age* (pp. 83-104): Brill.
- Foucault, M. (1986). Kant on Enlightenment and revolution*. *Economy and Society*, 15(1), 88-96.
- Freud, S. (1924). The dissolution of the Oedipus complex. *Standard edition*, 19, 173-179.
- Green, D., & Shapiro, I. (1996). *Pathologies of rational choice theory: A critique of applications in political science*: Yale University Press.
- Greenstreet, W. J., & Newton, I. (1927). *Isaac Newton: 1642-1727; a memorial volume*: Bell.
- Hegel, G. W. F., & Wood, A. W. (1991). *Hegel: Elements of the philosophy of right*: Cambridge University Press.
- Hobbes, T., & Molesworth, W. (1844). *The english works of Thomas Hobbes of Malmesbury* (Vol. 10): J. Bohn.
- Hume, D., & Beauchamp, T. L. (2000). *An enquiry concerning human understanding: A critical edition* (Vol. 3): Oxford University Press.
- Kant, I. (1964). *The Metaphysical Principles of Virtue: Part II of the Metaphysics of Morals* (Vol. 85): Bobbs-Merrill.
- Kennedy, K. (1999). Cynic rhetoric: The ethics and tactics of resistance. *Rhetoric Review*, 18(1), 26-45.
- Lane, M. (2002). Was Socrates a democrat? *History Today*, 52(1), 42.
- Locher, C. (1976). *PRIMARY AND SECONDARY THEMES IN MONTAIGNE'S «DES CANNIBALES»(I, 31)*. Paper presented at the French Forum.
- Locke, J. (1836). *An essay concerning human understanding*: T. Tegg and Son.
- Machiavelli, N., Bondanella, P., & Viroli, M. (2008). *The prince* (Vol. 43): Oxford University Press.
- Martin, W. O. (1957). The order and integration of knowledge.
- Marx, K. (1976). *The German ideology: including theses on Feuerbach and introduction to the critique of political economy*: Pyr Books.
- Mcdaniel, I. (2013). Philosophical history and the science of man in Scotland: Adam Ferguson's response to Rousseau. *Modern Intellectual History*, 10(03), 543-568.
- Mukherjee, S., Mukherjee, S., & Ramaswamy, S. (2002). *Socrates: Great Western Political Thinker* (Vol. 13): Deep and Deep Publications.
- Neuberger, J. (2004). *Caring for dying people of different faiths*: Radcliffe Publishing.
- O'Donnell, R. A. (1959). Individuation: An Example of the Development in the Thought of St. Thomas Aquinas. *The New Scholasticism*, 33(1), 49-67.
- Oliver, M. (1998). *History of philosophy*: Barnes & Noble Books.
- Pattberg, P. (2007). Conquest, domination and control: Europe's mastery of nature in historic perspective. *Journal of Political Ecology*, 14(1), 9.
- Piccone, P. (1968). Towards a Socio-Historical Interpretation of the Scientific Revolution. *Telos*, 1968(1), 16-26.
- Popper, K. R. (1972). Objective knowledge: An evolutionary approach.
- Ribner, I. (1954). Marlowe and Machiavelli. *Comparative Literature*, 6(4), 348-356.
- Robbins, C. (1983). The Lifelong Education of Thomas Paine (1737-1809): Some Reflections upon His Acquaintance among Books. *Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society*, 127(3), 135-142.
- Robinson, D. N. (1990). Wisdom through the ages. *Wisdom: Its nature, origins, and development*, 1, 13-24.
- Rössner, S. (2007). Francis Bacon (1561-1626). *Obesity Reviews*, 8(1), 83-83.
- Russell, B., & Eames, E. R. (1984). *Theory of knowledge: The 1913 manuscript* (Vol. 7): Psychology Press.
- Schoeck, R. J. (1991). Erasmus of Europe: The Making of a Humanist.

- Schönberger, R. (2001). *Thomas von Aquins" Summa contra gentiles"*: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft.
- Shea, L. (2010). *The cynic enlightenment: Diogenes in the salon*: JHU Press.
- Stayer, J. M. (2000). *Martin Luther, German saviour: German evangelical theological factions and the interpretation of Luther, 1917-1933*: McGill-Queen's Press-MQUP.
- Stretch, J. J. (1967). Existentialism: A proposed philosophical orientation for social work. *Social Work, 12*(4), 97-103.
- Urban, M., & Rhoads, B. (2003). Conceptions of nature: implications for an integrated geography. *Contemporary meanings in physical geography: From what to why*, 211-231.
- Westfall, R. S. (1989). *Essays on the Trial of Galileo. Vatican City State: Vatican Observatory; Notre Dame, Ind.: Distributed by the University of Notre Dame Press, 1989, 1.*
- Wittgenstein, L. (1958). *The blue and brown books*.